June 15, 2022

The Honorable David Wallace, Co-Chairperson
The Honorable David Hillman, Co-Chairperson
Uniform Personnel Classification and
Compensation Plan Subcommittee
Joint Budget Committee
State Capitol Building, Room 315
Little Rock, Arkansas 72201
Dear Senator Wallace and Representative Hillman:
The Office of Personnel Management (OPM) submits a request from the Public Service Commission (PSC) for your review. The Public Service Commission is requesting the establishment of a salary administration grid for public utility subject matter experts within the agency. Information pertaining to the requested grid along with the impacted classifications are displayed below:

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { CLASS } \\ & \text { CODE } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | CLASSIFICATION | GRADE | SALARY RANGE |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| X064C | PSC Public Utility Auditor | GS08 | \$45,010-\$65,264 |
| A046C | PSC Rate Case Analyst | GS09 | \$50,222-\$72,821 |
| X033C | PSC Senior Public Utility Auditor | GS11 | \$62,531-\$90,669 |
| A028C | PSC Senior Rate Case Analyst | GS11 | \$62,531-\$90,669 |
| A013C | PSC Director of Revenue Requirements | GS12 | \$69,776-\$101,175 |
| G299C | PSC Electric Cooperative Manager | GS12 | \$69,776-\$101,175 |
| B015C | Engineer Supervisor | GS12 | \$69,776-\$101,175 |
| G278C | PSC Research and Policy Director | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| X001C | PSC Director of Electric Utilities Section | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| A129C | PSC Quality Services Director | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| N043N | PSC Director of Financial Analysis | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| A130C | PSC Rates and Demand Resources Director | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| N248N | PSC Director of Pipeline Safety | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |
| P080C | PSC Director of Telecommunications and Consumer Services | GS14 | \$86,887-\$125,986 |

The Honorable David Wallace, Co-Chairperson
The Honorable David Hillman, Co-Chairperson
June 15, 2022
Page 2

## JUSTIFICATION

The Public Service Commission is requesting a salary administration grid in order to address ongoing recruitment and retention issues within the agency. According to the PSC, the positions within the impacted classifications have been advertised multiple times resulting in few qualified applicants and when qualified applicants are hired, PSC is unable to keep them due to noncompetitive salaries. As displayed in the table below, the combined turnover rate for all impacted positions within the past year is $16.22 \%$. Statewide turnover for the entire State of Arkansas has been $13.56 \%$ within the past year.

| $\begin{aligned} & \text { CLASS } \\ & \text { CODE } \end{aligned}$ | CLASSIFICATION | AUTHORIZED POSITIONS | FILLED POSITIONS | TURNOVER |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| X064C | PSC Public Utility Auditor | 5 |  | 25.00\% |
| A046C | PSC Rate Case Analyst | 13 | 10 | 9.09\% |
| X033C | PSC Senior Public Utility Auditor | 4 |  | 25.00\% |
| A028C | PSC Senior Rate Case Analyst | 7 | 7 | 12.50\% |
| A013C | PSC Director of Revenue | 1 | 1 | 50.00\% |
| G299C | PSC Electric Cooperative Manager | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| B015C | Engineer Supervisor | 1 | 1 | 50.00\% |
| G278C | PSC Research and Policy Director | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| X001C | PSC Director of Electric Utilities Section Section | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| A129C | PSC Quality Services Director | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| N043N | PSC Director of Financial Analysis | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| A130C | PSC Rates and Demand Resources | 1 | 1 | 0.00\% |
| N248N | PSC Director of Pipeline Safety | 1 | 0 | 0.00\% |
| P080C | PSC Director of Telecommunications and Consumer Services | 1 | 0 | 0.00\% |
| OVERALL TURNOVER RATE |  |  |  | 16.22\% |

According to the proposed salary administration grid, incumbents within the included classifications would be authorized to receive up to midpoint for the grade as a starting salary and would receive a salary increase of up to $5 \%$ per fiscal year, not to exceed the maximum salary or the grade. In order to qualify for this increase, an incumbent within the specified classifications must have:

The Honorable David Wallace, Co-Chairperson
The Honorable David Hillman, Co-Chairperson June 15, 2022
Page 3

- at least 12 months of service within the classification
- receive a score of highly effective (4) or higher on performance evaluations
- receive a recommendation from their supervisor, or
- receive enhanced credentials as an expert as demonstrated by

1. attainment of the professional credential for the discipline, or
2. a master's level degree or higher in a field directly related to the position, or
3. demonstrated progression of expertise as a subject matter expert (SME) in a key/foundational area of public utility regulation over a 3-year period in proceedings before the Commission

This requested this salary administration grid to address recruitment and retention issues within the department. There are 31 current incumbents within the classifications, and under the proposed grid 28 employees will receive the $5 \%$ increase with a total cost of approximately $\$ 102,436$.

## RECOMMENDATION

The Office of Personnel Management has reviewed this request from the Public Service Commission and recommends approval of a salary administration grid for the classifications as listed above. The agency guarantees that it possesses sufficient funding to support this request.

Your consideration of this request is greatly appreciated.
Sincerely,


Kay Barnhill, Director Office of Personnel Management


KB/sd:1-3

Ted J. Thomas Chairman (501) 682-5806

Kimberly A. O'Guinn Commissioner (501) 682-5809

Justin Tate Commissioner (501) 682-5809

ARKANSAS
PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION UTILITIES DIVISION 1000 Center Street P.O. Box 400

Little Rock, Arkansas 72203-0400 http://www.Arkansas.gov/psc


Donna Gray Executive Director (501) 682-1794


BY:

Ms. Kay Barnhill, Director
Office of Personnel Management
501 Woodlane, Suite 201
Little Rock, AR 72201
Re: PSC Requested Subject Matter Expert Salary Grid
Dear Ms. Barnhill:
The Arkansas Public Service Commission (PSC) is requesting authorization to establish a salary administration grid for its public utility subject matter expert positions (GS08, GS09, GS11, GS12, and GS14) within our agency. The intention of this plan is to be more competitive with the public utility sector and is considered vital in maintaining the current professional level of competency and ability of our staff.

This grid is for the purposes of hiring and retaining capable and highly qualified candidates. This is in direct response to employee turnover and the inability to attract a qualified applicant pool. This proposed salary grid would afford the agency a clear path for progression and retention of subject matter expertise critical to operations in compliance with statutory deadlines.

The specific public utility subject matter expert positions are listed below:
PUBLIC UTILITY SUBJECT MATTER EXPERT POSITIONS

| Class <br> Code | Grade | Title | State Salary Range |
| :---: | :---: | :--- | :---: |
| X064C | GS08 | PSC Public Utility Auditor (5) | $\$ 45,010-\$ 65,265$ |
| A046C | GS09 | PSC Rate Case Analyst (13) | $\$ 50,222-\$ 72,822$ |
| X033C | GS11 | PSC Senior Public Utility Auditor (4) | $\$ 62,531-\$ 90,670$ |
| A028C | GS11 | PSC Senior Rate Case Analyst (7) | $\$ 62,531-\$ 90,670$ |
| A013C | GS12 | PSC Director of Revenue Requirements | $\$ 69,776-\$ 101,175$ |
| G299C | GS12 | PSC Electric Cooperative Manager | $\$ 69,776-\$ 101,175$ |
| B015C | GS12 | PSC Pipeline Safety Program Manager | $\$ 69,776-\$ 101,175$ |
| G278C | GS14 | PSC Research and Policy Director | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |


| X001C | GS14 | PSC Director of Electric Utilities Section | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| A013C | GS14 | PSC Quality Services Director | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |
| N043N | GS14 | PSC Director of Financial Analysis | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |
| A130C | GS14 | PSC Rates \& Demand Resources Director | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |
| N248N | GS14 | PSC Director of Pipeline Safety | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |
| P080C | GS14 |  <br> Consumer Services | $\$ 86,887-\$ 125,986$ |

Despite multiple efforts, we have had a difficult time attracting a qualified applicant pool for several accounting and analyst positions. For example, after one unsuccessful posting for a Public Utility Auditor (GS08), our second posting attracted only two qualified applicants, with one declining the interview upon inquiring about the salary. In addition to the educational requirements, the GS08 Auditor position requires three years of experience in auditing or financial analysis of utility companies, or related and the GS09 Rate Case analyst position requires four years of experience in rate analysis, financial analysis, economic forecasting, or related. Attracting individuals with this level of experience has proven difficult.

When we are able to hire qualified applicants, retention then becomes an issue and further causes difficulty in filling manager and director positions. Public utilities are our biggest competition for well qualified individuals in this unique and complex industry sector. The U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics continues to report utilities are the highest paid private sector in the nation. (See https://www.bls.gov/news.release/empsit.t19.htm) Both auditors and analysts are able to gain training and knowledge of the regulatory environment in our agency and then often seek out employment from or are sought by our local utilities. By way of example, a recently promoted (from GS09 to GS11) and highly capable analyst was able to find employment with a local utility for a $\$ 30,000$ increase in salary. This pay discrepancy is not unusual. Not being able to offer a reasonably competitive salary is a significant hinderance to attracting and retaining employees in our industry.

Based on our research of utility job postings we have several observations. An analyst position (requiring 3 years of experience), similar to our GS09 Rate Case Analyst position would be eligible for a salary range of $\$ 69,800-\$ 104,800$. A senior level analyst similar to our GS11 position (requiring 5 years of experience) would be eligible for $\$ 71,550$ $\$ 107,400$, with a Rates Specialist position (requiring 9-10 years of experience) as recently advertised by a local utility, offering a salary range of $\$ 93,000-\$ 121,200$ per year. Recent utility managerial job postings with a different local utility advertised Regulatory Manager positions (akin to our GS12 Manager and GS14 Director positions) requiring a minimum of 5 years of experience and offering a salary range of $\$ 93,000-\$ 153,450$.

Our team of managers and directors serve as our project managers on all docketed proceedings before the Commission and also serve as lead subject matter experts and witnesses. These key leadership and highly knowledgeable and trained resources are
critical to the fulfillment of the agency's charge to ensure safe and reliable service at just and reasonable rates.

Our agency's workload continues to grow at an unprecedented rate with issues on the forefront of the everchanging utility environment. For example, legislation authorizing utilities to request annual adjustments to rates, the rapid expansion of renewable energy owned by both customers and utilities, and the necessary participation in regional transmission organizations have significantly increased the agency's workload over the last decade without a concomitant increase in personnel. Several positions regularly require working hours well in excess of 40 hours each week. Staff endeavors to thoroughly and successfully address the complex and ever evolving issues brought before the Commission and in order to do so it is imperative that we attract and retain professional, capable, and highly qualified individuals. It takes three to five years for new hires to gain the foundational experience, competency, and expertise which is far too often lost due a lack of competitive salary. When our agency loses trained and competent employees, utility customers of Arkansas lose, too. Our intent with this request is to be reasonably competitive with the utility sector in an effort to attract and retain highly capable employees.

Given this purpose and the noted challenges, the PSC proposes the following salary grid administration:

1. After twelve (12) months of service in the indicated position; and
2. a clear pattern of Role Model (PE rating 5) or Highly Effective (PE rating 4) job performance; and
3. a recommendation by the employee's supervisor; or
4. enhanced credentials as an expert as demonstrated by;

- attainment of the professional credential for the discipline (e.g., Certified Public Accountant for GS08 and GS11 auditor positions, Certified Depreciation Professional for depreciation experts, Certified Rate of Return Analyst for finance experts); or
- a master's level degree or higher in a field directly relevant to the position; or
- demonstrated progression of expertise as a subject matter expert in a key and foundational area(s) of public utility regulation over a 3-year period in proceedings before the Commission.

The employee would then be eligible for up to a $5 \%$ salary increase, per fiscal year, not to exceed the maximum for the grade level of the position. Any disciplinary action or managerial intervention will be taken into account before a recommendation is made.

These job classifications would be authorized to pay up to the midpoint salary of the Career Service Pay Plan as a starting rate of pay if the minimum qualifications (as determined by the Office of Personnel Management), and the additional qualifications specified are met by the prospective candidate for the job.

Ms. Kay Barnhill Page -4-

There are 39 positions within the proposed classifications which could potentially be eligible over time under the proposed grid. Based on current information, the cost of implementation on an annual basis assuming full eligibility would not exceed $\$ 120,082$, inclusive of benefits.

This proposal would be implemented at the discretion of the PSC Chairman and based on recommendations from the General Staff Executive Director for advocacy staff and the Chief of Staff of the Commission for advisory staff, and will be based on the availability of revenues.

Thank you for your consideration and please let me know if you have any questions or need further information.

Sincerely,


Donna Gray

cc: Ted Thomas<br>Victoria Peterson<br>Vikki Moore-Hearn

