



BureauBrief

TO : The House and Senate Education Committees
FROM: Policy Analysis and Research Section, Bureau of Legislative Research
DATE : October 8, 2018
SUBJECT : Digital Learning Provider Survey Project# 18-001-29

While working on the Resource Allocation report for the 2018 educational adequacy study, the Bureau of Legislative Research attempted to determine how much money school districts and charter schools were spending on digital learning, particularly when using an outside course vendor. BLR staff requested digital learning expenditure data from districts, but the financial information districts provided did not appear to line up with the course enrollment data districts had entered in APSCN. Therefore, on June 18, 2018, the House and Senate Education Committees voted to request this information from the digital learning providers themselves, in the hopes of receiving more consistent financial and enrollment information.

Digital Learning Background

To understand the data the digital learning providers submitted through the BLR survey, it may be helpful to first understand how digital learning functions in Arkansas schools. State statute refers to both “distance learning” and “digital learning” and defines them as follows:

Distance learning: “an interactive telecommunications system that utilizes information technology, audio, video, and similar technological elements, is compatible with other distance learning networks, and is used for the purpose of enhancing instructional opportunities in Arkansas public schools” § 6-47-403(4).

Digital learning: “a digital technology or internet-based educational delivery model that does not rely exclusively on compressed interactive video” § 6-16-1403(a)(1).

For a number of years, distance learning typically referred to instruction delivered in one location and made available to classrooms across the state via compressed interactive video. As distance learning began to rely less on compressed video, the terminology shifted to “digital learning”. ADE rules further specify that “digital learning may be a type of distance learning,” suggesting that distance learning is the umbrella term with digital learning serving as a type of distance learning (Rules Governing Distance and Digital Learning). For simplicity’s sake, this document uses the terms interchangeably.

Distance learning classrooms may contain a group of students enrolled in one course or students simultaneously working on various courses. Students may be able to remotely interact with their instructor and one another. State law allows distance learning courses to be online-based, where instruction is primarily delivered over the internet, or these courses can be taught using “**blended learning**,” meaning a combination of on-site instruction and some instruction delivered using technology. ADE specifies, however, that there is a difference between a blended learning digital course and a course that happens to use online resources in the classroom. For a blended learning course to be considered a digital learning course, it must allow students to have control over some elements of the course, such as the course pacing (e.g., students move through the course content at their own pace) or place of learning (e.g., in a physical classroom or at home). Blended learning courses may also involve online content personalized for students or a learning management system (e.g., moodle, Blackboard or Google Classroom), rather than simply using instructional videos or academic content available online.

BUREAU OF LEGISLATIVE RESEARCH

One Capitol Mall, 5TH Floor | Little Rock, Ark., 72201 | (501) 682-1937

Fax: 682-3072 www.blr.arkansas.gov

In the APSCN system, districts identify their digital learning courses as full service, content only, or home grown.

- **Full service** delivery means the entity providing the online course (the online course vendor) employs the “**teacher of record**” and is responsible for providing all content and curriculum. The teacher of record is the educator responsible for providing instruction, grading students’ work, and supervising assessments. Full service means the outside digital learning provider provides the entire instructional service.
- **Content only** indicates the district’s own teacher serves as the teacher of record, but the course also relies on curriculum delivered online through an outside vendor. For content only courses, districts are purchasing content from an outside provider, but the district continues to provide instructional staff.
- **Home grown** means the online content is developed by the school or district, and instruction is delivered by a district-employed teacher.¹ Home grown courses do not utilize an outside vendor.

The most commonly used digital learning delivery method is full service as shown in the following table, according to course enrollment data reported by districts in APSCN for 2016-17. (Courses offered by multiple schools or districts and students taking multiple digital learning courses are counted more than once.)

Delivery Method	Courses	Students
Full service	4,020	48,983
Content only	443	19,039
Home grown	331	21,315

Digital Learning Providers

Distance learning was originally implemented in the state by Act 1083 of 1999. Historically, distance learning in Arkansas has been provided primarily—if not exclusively—by the state through grants offered to education service cooperatives and the Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences and Arts. The co-ops work together as a consortium, known as **Virtual Arkansas**, to provide a coordinated network of distance learning courses statewide. The three co-ops that make up Virtual Arkansas employ the instructors teaching the classes. Virtual Arkansas activities are organized by a state coordinator housed at the Arch Ford Cooperative and are supported by state grants.

To supplement the state grants, districts that use Virtual Arkansas pay the consortium an annual membership fee of \$2,500. The consortium also charges a fee of \$15 to \$50 per student per course per semester for distance learning courses in which the districts enrolled students. Because Virtual Arkansas is supported by state funding, its courses are generally less expensive for the districts than those offered by private providers. As a result, Virtual Arkansas remains the primary digital learning provider in Arkansas public schools.

While Virtual Arkansas has long been the primary digital learning provider, Act 1280 of 2013 established criteria for companies to become “approved digital learning providers” in Arkansas, opening the door to districts’ use of other distance learning providers. Technically districts already had the authority to use other digital learning providers prior to this 2013 Act. The original 1999 distance learning legislation allowed schools to “import courses from outside the state,” but required course curriculum offered by out-of-state providers to be approved by ADE before the course could be offered through distance learning.² This language was amended in 2009 to specify that the out-of-state providers—rather than their course curriculum—were to be approved by ADE.³ That said, a current

¹ http://www.arkansased.gov/public/userfiles/Learning_Services/Digital_Learning/FAQ_for_Act_1280.pdf

² Act 1083 of 1999

³ Act 1469 of 2009

ADE employee and a former ADE employee involved in digital learning were unaware of any out-of-state distance learning providers operating in Arkansas prior to 2013 (not including software for credit recovery and other skills).⁴

The new law passed in 2013 established a process by which digital learning providers could become approved by ADE and required ADE to publish a list of approved digital learning providers. The current list can be accessed here: <http://www.arkansased.gov/divisions/learning-services/digital-learning-providers/approved-digital-providers-course-list>. The statute crafted in 2013 does not require school districts to use an approved provider for the digital learning courses they offer students. Nor does it require all providers to become approved in order to sell their courses or other products to school districts. However, out-of-state providers and school districts offering digital learning courses to other districts' students may be exceptions.

- **Out-of-state providers:** As noted previously, the older section of statute allows schools to use an out-of-state provider, "if the out-of-state provider is approved by the department before the school offers the courses through distance learning."⁵ This seems to suggest that if districts use out-of-state providers, those providers must be ADE-approved.
- **School districts providing digital learning course to other districts' students:** ADE rules specify that districts can create digital learning courses and offer them to their own students without becoming an ADE-approved provider, but districts that "provide digital learning courses to students other than their own students without the assistance of an external digital learning provider are required to seek approval."⁶

Though state approval is not required for some digital learning providers, organizations may seek approval for the credibility it can communicate to school customers and for the opportunity to be listed on ADE's website.

To become an approved digital learning provider, state law requires providers to:

- Be nonsectarian and nondiscriminatory.
- Demonstrate or partner with an organization that demonstrates "successful experience in furnishing digital learning courses to public school students as demonstrated by student growth in each subject area and grade level" of the courses it wants to offer in Arkansas.
- Meet or exceed the minimum curriculum standards and requirements established by the State Board of Education and ensure instructional and curricular quality through a curriculum and accountability plan that addresses every subject area and grade level for which it agrees to provide digital learning courses.
- Use "qualified teachers" to provide instruction. Teachers are not required to be licensed by the Arkansas State Board of Education to be considered qualified, but they must "meet the minimum qualifications for teaching in a core content area." ADE indicated that that means digital learning teachers who are not licensed by the state must qualify as an Arkansas Qualified Teacher (AQT).⁷ Under ADE's rules on AQTs, AQTs must have at least a bachelor's degree and meet at least one of a list of criteria (e.g., degree is in the content area the teacher is teaching, teacher has at least 18 college credit hours in the content area teaching, etc.). Teachers may also qualify as an AQT if they previously qualified as a highly qualified teacher

⁴ Huff, E., Arkansas Department of Education, Oct. 2, 2018, email and Swan, C., Arkansas River Education Service Cooperative, Oct. 4, 2018, email to Ernie Huff.

⁵ Ark. Code Ann. § 6-47-201

⁶ Arkansas Code Ann. §6-47-406(f)(1) Provides another condition with respect to digital learning courses by requiring public school districts or open-enrollment charter schools that plan to offer public school students, home-schooled students, or private school students a distance learning course that is not part of the curriculum required by the Standards for Accreditation to first obtain approval of the specific course by the ADE.

⁷ Reinhart, C., ADE, Sept. 28, 2018, email.

under No Child Left Behind (has at least a bachelor's degree, holds an appropriate state teaching license and demonstrates subject area competence by having passed relevant licensure tests, such as specified Praxis assessments).

State law does not require an annual reapproval process for approved providers, and ADE indicated that they have not established one. In practice that means that once a provider has been approved, the provider remains approved without any additional contact or follow up needed. ADE has indicated that they do update approved providers when there are changes in curriculum standards and communicate other information providers need to know. In 2016-17 school year, there 41 approved distance learning providers, and one additional provider was approved for 2017-18.

While the approved provider process does not require annual reapproval for digital learning providers, ADE's rules do require schools and districts to ensure course content and instruction meet specified standards. ADE rules specify that that "all distance learning courses shall have an appropriately licensed or approved primary instructor." The rules also specify that distance learning courses must be approved by ADE or the Arkansas Department of Career Education, which regulates career and technical education. However, the rules allow for an exception from this approval requirement if the course content is 1.) "aligned with the appropriate content standards and curriculum frameworks developed and approved by the State Board of Education or the Department of Career Education" or 2.) is not offered for credit. ADE rules approved in 2016 indicate that digital learning courses are considered "large group instruction courses," which means they are not required to comply with traditional class size limits. Previous rules limited distance learning classes to 30 students per teacher (or a total of 150 students per teacher per day).

In addition to establishing the approval process for digital learning providers, Act 1280 of 2013 also requires all school districts to provide at least one digital learning course beginning in the 2014-15 school year. The law also requires students, beginning with the ninth grade class of 2014-15, to take at least one digital learning course to graduate from high school. The senior class of 2017-18 was the first class to graduate with this requirement. Taken together, these policies led to a significant increase in districts offering digital learning courses and an expansion in the organizations offering these courses in Arkansas.

Digital Learning Provider Survey

The Digital Learning Provider Survey was distributed to 39 of the 41 approved digital learning providers listed in the Arkansas Department of Education's Statewide Information System (SIS) Handbook.⁸ Thirty-seven approved digital learning providers responded to the survey. Of the two providers that received a survey but did not respond, APEX Learning, Inc. supplied a partial response, and Edmentum, Inc. did not provide any response. The company also did not respond to a recent email. **APPENDIX A** provides a complete listing of all 2017-18 ADE approved digital learning providers.

The survey requested the following information from each digital learning provider. The BLR also provided a uniform response sheet providers were to use to submit this information.

1. Total amount paid to your organization by each Arkansas public school district/open enrollment charter school broken out as follows:
 - Total amount each school district/open enrollment charter school paid for credit-bearing courses in which **your organization's staff** served as the teacher(s) of record (Please include all related per-student and upfront charges associated with these courses. For example, if your organization charges an initial fee/membership fee and an additional per-student fee for each course, please provide the sum of the charges.)

⁸ One of the two providers that did not receive a survey offers a free online service, and the company does not track the school districts using its service. The other provider may not provide courses to districts; an email to verify was not returned. Another digital learning provider, approved for the first time in 2017-18, was not listed in the SIS handbook and therefore was not on BLR's list to receive a survey. A recent email to the provider was not answered.

- Total amount each school district/open enrollment charter school paid for credit-bearing courses in which the **school district's staff** served as the teacher(s) of record (Please include all related per-student and upfront charges associated with these courses. For example, if your organization charges an initial fee/membership fee and an additional per-student fee for each course, please provide the sum of the charges, **unless that initial/membership fee has been included above.**)
 - Total amount the school district/open enrollment charter school paid for other digital learning-related services and resources, not included above.
2. Total students enrolled each semester in credit-bearing courses in which your organization's staff serves as the teacher of record. (Students enrolled in more than one course should be counted for each course in which they are enrolled. Students enrolled in a year-long course should be counted separately for each semester enrolled.)
 3. Total students enrolled each semester in credit-bearing courses in which the school district's staff serves as the teacher of record. (Students enrolled in more than one course should be counted for each course in which they are enrolled. Students enrolled in a year-long course should be counted separately for each semester enrolled.) If your organization does not track the number of students enrolled in courses using your curriculum, please enter "Not available."

The survey sought the amount of money districts and open enrollment charter schools were paying for digital learning services, not the entire cost of providing the services. For example, the data do not include state grants provided to some providers, particularly Virtual Arkansas, nor does it include any tuition paid to the provider by individual students (e.g., for concurrent enrollment courses). The survey requested only the amount of money school districts and open enrollment charter schools paid.

2016-17 Survey Responses

In 2016-17, sixteen of the respondents reported they did not receive any revenue from Arkansas districts or charters and also did not report any enrollment in their digital learning courses. The remaining 21 providers surveyed reported a total of \$4.2 million in revenue in 2016-17, and total enrollment of 71,805. Ninety-six percent (96%) of the revenue digital learning providers reported was received from districts and charters, but several reported revenue and enrollment for a few other educational entities as well, including juvenile justice programs, mental health providers, non-profit providers (Boys and Girls Clubs), private schools, Secondary Area Technical Centers, state agencies (Blind and Deaf School), and the statewide program, Virtual Arkansas. Virtual Arkansas is a digital learning provider that provides digital courses to school districts, but they also purchase digital courses on behalf of school districts. In 2016-17, Florida Virtual School Global reported that Virtual Arkansas paid them a total of \$60,738 for digital learning courses.

Of the total revenue reported, \$2.4 million, or 58%, was received for digital courses where the provider was the teacher of record ((TOR), i.e., **full service**), and \$929,635, or 22%, was received for digital courses for which the providers provided course content, but the school district, charter, or other entity provided the teacher of record (i.e., **content only**). In addition, they reported receiving \$836,591, or 20%, for other services and resources (e.g., additional content outside any particular courses). Out of the total enrollment, 45,223, or 63%, of the enrollees participated in courses in which the providers served as the teacher of record and 26,582, or 37%, of the enrollees participated in classes in which the school districts/charters/other entities (such as private schools), served as the teacher of record. The table below provides the amount of revenue and enrollment reported by the 21 respondents who had revenue and enrollment to report. It is important to note, that the revenue that is being reported is the revenue received from school districts, charters, and other entities described above. It is not inclusive of any grants that any of these providers may have received or concurrent credit tuition paid by students.

Digital Learning Providers – 2016-17 Revenues and Enrollment

Digital Learning Provider	Revenues				Enrollment			
	Full Service	Content Only	Other Services and Resources	Total Revenues	Fall Full Service	Spring Full Service	Fall Content Only	Spring Content Only
Ark. Northeastern College	\$4,275	\$0	\$0	\$4,275	14	34	0	0
Ark. Public School Resource Ctr.	\$78,689	\$0	\$0	\$78,689	323	89		
Ark School for Math, Sci. & Art	\$34,857	\$0	\$0	\$34,857	431	394	0	0
Ark. State Univ.	\$0	\$0	\$3,094	\$3,094	95	104	0	0
Crystal Bridges Museum of Art	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	0	0	0	184
Edgenuity	\$33,800	\$113,800	\$27,500	\$175,100	54	70	2,630	2,759
Fuel Education (K-12 Inc.)	\$147,845	\$78,603	\$193,984	\$420,432	248	166	695	681
Florida Virtual School Global*	\$0	\$60,488	\$250	\$60,738	0	0	1,850	1,956
North Ark. College	\$7,350	\$0	\$2,473	\$9,823	33	16	0	0
National Park College	\$17,586	\$49,350	\$0	\$66,936	56	11	27	22
Northwest Ark. Comm. College	\$55,019	\$0	\$0	\$55,019	157	160	0	0
Odysseyware	\$8,340	\$549,604	\$47,590	\$605,534	0	21	4,469	5,912
Ozarka College	\$13,050	\$0	\$0	\$13,050	30	57	0	0
Pearson (Connection Ed., LLC)	\$25,328	\$0	\$0	\$25,328	34	38	0	0
Rich Mountain Comm. College	\$13,112	\$0	\$0	\$13,112	56	80		
Southern Ark. Univ.-Magnolia	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	49	58	0	0
SE Ark. Comm. Based Ed. Ctr.	\$607,209	\$0	\$0	\$607,209	586	535		
SE Ark. College	\$0	\$0	\$19,200	\$19,200				
UA Comm. College-Batesville	\$15,840	\$0	\$0	\$15,840	48	51	0	0
UA Fort Smith	\$136,750	\$0	\$0	\$136,750	260	287		
Virtual Arkansas	\$1,235,113	\$77,790	\$542,500	\$1,855,403	19,972	20,606	2,457	2,940
TOTAL	\$2,434,163	\$929,635	\$836,591	\$4,200,389	22,446	22,777	12,128	14,454

*All of the revenue received by Florida Virtual School Global (FVSG) in 2016-17, was received from Virtual Arkansas, who purchased digital courses for use by districts. It is possible that the inclusion of this revenue could result in the duplication of revenue with Virtual Arkansas reporting revenue they received from districts for the digital courses they purchased from FVSG.

The following table provides the amount of revenue paid per enrollee for each of the responding providers. National Park College reported the highest amount of total revenue received per enrollee, \$577.03, and ASU reported receiving the lowest total revenue per enrollee, \$15.55. The lower revenue per enrollee for ASU may be due to ASU receiving revenue from only one of the four districts for which they provided digital courses.

When examining the cost of digital learning, it may be useful to use current statute as a point of reference. State law allows school districts to offer distance learning courses to private school students or home schooled students. If the district provides a course to such students, the school district is entitled to funding in the amount of 1/6th of the foundation funding amount for each course taught. In 2016-17, that's about \$1,108 per course and \$1,119 in 2017-18.

Another point of reference for examining the per-student cost of digital learning courses is the typical cost of a teacher for a single traditional course. For example, in 2016-17, districts received \$64,196 in foundation funding to pay the salary and benefits for a single teacher. That calculates to between \$428 and \$535 per student, depending on the grade level of the student, for a single year-long class/course (based on the average number of students per class to which districts are limited).

2016-17 Revenues Per Enrollee			
Digital Learning Provider	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Full Service	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Content Only	Total Revenue Enrollee Per Semester
Ark. Northeastern College	\$89.06	-	\$89.06
Ark. Public School Resource Ctr.	\$190.99	-	\$190.99
Ark. School for Math, Sci. & Art	\$42.25	-	\$42.25
Ark. State Univ.	-	-	\$15.55
Crystal Bridges Museum of Art	-	-	-
Edgenuity	\$272.58	\$21.12	\$31.76
Fuel Education (K-12 Inc.)	\$357.11	\$57.12	\$234.88
Florida Virtual School Global	-	\$15.89	5.96
North Ark. College	\$150.00	-	\$200.47
National Park College	\$262.48	\$1,007.14	\$577.03
Northwest Ark. Comm. College	\$173.56	-	\$173.56
Odysseyware	\$397.14	\$52.94	\$58.21
Ozarka College	\$150.00	-	\$150.00
Pearson (Connection Ed.,LLC)	\$351.78	-	\$351.78
Rich Mountain Comm. College	\$96.41	-	\$96.41
Southern Ark. Univ.-Magnolia	-	-	-
SE Ark. Comm. Based Ed. Ctr.	\$541.67	-	\$541.67
SE Ark. College	-	-	-
UA Comm. College-Batesville	\$160.00	-	\$160.00
UA Fort Smith	\$250.00	-	\$250.00
Virtual Arkansas	\$30.44	\$14.41	\$40.36
TOTAL	\$53.83	\$34.97	\$58.50

Note: Crystal Bridges Museum of American Art and SAU-Magnolia do not have revenue per enrollee reported above because they did not report any revenue received for their digital classes. Southeast Arkansas College also does not have revenue per enrollee reported due to no reported enrollment.

Virtual Arkansas received approximately \$4.3 million in 2016-17 in state grants to provide digital instruction to school districts and charters. In addition, the Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences and the Arts (ASMSA) also received a state grant of \$500,000 in both 2016-17 and 2017-18 which also allowed them to not charge for 86% of their enrollees in 2016-17 and 97% of their enrollees in 2017-18. These state funds can result in the revenue per enrollee to be less for Virtual Arkansas and ASMSA than other digital learning providers, and this in turn can have the effect of lowering the overall total revenues per enrollee. Upon removing Virtual Arkansas's and ASMSA's reported revenues and enrollment from the total revenue per enrollee calculations, the revenue per enrollee amounts increase significantly. Another factor that contributes to the variance between revenues per enrollee with and without Virtual Arkansas and ASMSA, is that these two providers account for 45% of total revenues and 65% of total enrollment that was reported. See the table below to see the impact of removing Virtual Arkansas and ASMSA from the calculations of total revenue per enrollee.

2016-17 Revenue Per Enrollee With and Without Virtual Arkansas (VA) and Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences and the Arts (ASMSA)			
	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Full Service	Revenue Per Enrollee per Semester Content Only	Total Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester
Without VA & ASMSA	\$304.76	\$40.21	\$92.39
With VA & ASMSA	\$53.83	\$34.97	\$58.50

2017-18 Survey Responses

In 2017-18, 26 providers reported a total of \$4.8 million in revenue and a total enrollment of 90,212, which is an overall increase of \$642,790, or 15%, in revenues and 18,407, or 26%, in enrollees over 2016-17. Of the total revenue reported, \$3.4 million, or 71%, was received for digital courses where the provider was the teacher of record (**full service**), and \$1.2 million, or 25%, was received for digital courses for which they provided course content, but the school district, charter, or other entity provided the teacher of record (**content only**). In addition, providers reported receiving \$189,904, or 4%, for other services and resources.

Revenues increased \$1 million in 2017-18 over 2016-17 for the courses in which the provider is the teacher of record, and increased \$279,901 for courses in which the districts/charters employ the teacher of record. Revenues decreased, however, in 2017-18 for other services and resources by \$640,687.

Digital Learning Providers – 2017-18 Revenues and Enrollment

Digital Learning Provider	Revenues				Enrollment			
	Full Service	Content Only	Other Services and Resources	Total Revenues	Fall Full Service	Spring Full Service	Fall Content Only	Spring Content Only
Ark. Northeastern College	\$6,685	\$0	\$0	\$6,685	35	41	0	0
Ark. Public School Resource Ctr.	\$88,949	\$0	\$0	\$88,949	100	241	0	0
Ark School for Math, Sci. & Art	\$43,225	\$0	\$0	\$43,225	926	780	0	0
Ark. State Univ.	\$5,303	\$0	\$988	\$6,290	133	139	0	0
Brigham Young Univ.	\$0	\$2,060	\$0	\$2,060	0	0	0	47
Crystal Bridges Museum of Art	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	0	0	231	189
Cossatot Comm. College UA	\$21,000	\$0	\$0	\$21,000	163	257	0	0
Edgenuity	\$186,350	\$267,656	\$80,100	\$534,106	162	446	6,457	6,226
Fuel Education (K-12 Inc.)	\$66,658	\$0	\$21,824	\$88,482	33	35	286	375
Florida Virtual School Global	\$36,400	\$160,499	\$15,301	\$212,200	13	14	2,827	2,821
North Ark. College	\$12,486	\$0	\$2,691	\$15,177	45	36	0	0
National Park College	\$29,872	\$63,861	\$0	\$93,733	18	13	38	24
Northwest Ark. Comm. College	\$82,061	\$0	\$0	\$82,061	191	284	0	0
Odysseyware	\$14,760	\$593,884	\$39,300	\$647,944	35	7	6,038	7,491
Ozarka College	\$20,350	\$0	\$0	\$20,350	65	71	0	0
Pearson (Connection Ed.,LLC)	\$234,350	\$9,105	\$500	\$243,955	65	65	43	76
Proximity Learning	\$700	\$0	\$0	\$700	1	1	0	0
Rich Mountain Comm. College	\$15,872	\$0	\$0	\$15,872	67	131	0	0
Southern Ark. Univ.-Magnolia	\$0	\$0	\$0	\$0	96	99	0	0
SE Ark. Comm. Based Ed. Ctr.	\$591,500	\$0	\$0	\$591,500	584	508	0	0
SE Ark. College	\$0	\$0	\$19,200	\$19,200	0	0	0	0
SkillBott, Inc.	\$0	\$13,350	\$0	\$13,350	0	0	60	210
UA Comm. College-Batesville	\$8,960	\$0	\$0	\$8,960	28	28	0	0
UA Fort Smith	\$165,500	\$0	\$0	\$165,500	314	348	0	0
UA Little Rock	\$18,675	\$0	\$0	\$18,675	66	59	0	0
Virtual Arkansas	\$1,794,683	\$99,120	\$10,000	\$1,903,803	21,981	21,422	3,122	3,505
TOTAL	\$3,444,339	\$1,209,536	\$189,904	\$4,843,779	25,121	25,025	19,102	20,964

Similar to 2016-17, National Park College reported the highest amount of total revenue received per enrollee in 2017-18, \$1,007.88, and ASU reported receiving the lowest total revenue per enrollee, \$23.13. The overall total revenue per enrollee for all providers was \$53.69, which is a decrease of \$4.82 from the prior overall total revenue per enrollee.

2017-18 Revenues Per Enrollee			
Digital Learning Provider	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Full Service	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Content Only	Total Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester
Ark. Northeastern College	\$87.96	-	\$87.96
Ark. Public School Resource Ctr.	\$260.85	-	\$260.85
Ark School for Math, Sci. & Art	\$25.34	-	\$25.34
Ark. State Univ.	\$19.49	-	\$23.13
Brigham Young Univ.	-	\$43.83	\$43.83
Crystal Bridges Museum of Art	-	-	-
Cossatot Comm. College UA	\$50.00	-	\$50.00
Edgenuity	\$306.50	\$21.10	\$40.19
Fuel Education (K-12 Inc.)	\$980.27	-	\$121.37
Florida Virtual School Global	\$1,348.15	\$28.42	\$37.39
North Ark. College	\$154.15	-	\$187.37
National Park College	\$963.61	\$1,030.02	\$1,007.88
Northwest Ark. Comm. College	\$172.76	-	\$172.76
Odysseyware	\$351.43	\$43.90	\$47.74
Ozarka College	\$149.63	-	\$149.63
Pearson (Connection Ed.,LLC)	\$1,802.69	\$76.52	\$979.74
Proximity Learning	\$350.00	-	\$350.00
Rich Mountain Comm. College	\$80.16	-	\$80.16
Southern Ark. Univ.-Magnolia	-	-	-
SE Ark. Comm. Based Ed. Ctr.	\$541.67	-	\$541.67
SE Ark. College	-	-	-
SkillBott, Inc.	-	\$49.44	\$49.44
UA Comm. College-Batesville	\$160.00	-	\$160.00
UA Fort Smith	\$250.00	-	\$250.00
UA Little Rock	\$149.40	-	\$149.40
Virtual Arkansas	\$41.35	\$14.96	\$38.05
TOTAL	\$68.69	\$30.19	\$53.69

Note: Crystal Bridges Museum of American Art and SAU-Magnolia do not have revenue per enrollee reported above because they did not report any revenue received for their digital classes. Southeast Arkansas College also does not have revenue per enrollee reported due to no reported enrollment.

Again, due to the fact that Virtual Arkansas (VA) and ASMSA receive funding from the state to provide digital courses to school districts, the table below shows the overall revenues per enrollee both with and without the revenues and enrollment reported by VA and ASMSA. As was the case in 2016-17, the 2017-18 revenue per enrollee increases with the removal of the revenue and enrollment data reported by VA and ASMSA.

2017-18 Revenue Per Enrollee With and Without Virtual Arkansas (VA) and Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences and the Arts (ASMSA)			
	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Full Service	Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester Content Only	Total Revenue Per Enrollee Per Semester
Without VA & ASMSA	\$318.93	\$33.21	\$75.29
With VA & ASMSA	\$68.69	\$30.19	\$53.69

APPENDIX A:

2017-18 ADE Approved Digital Learning Providers
Apex Learning Inc.
Arkansas Department of Career Education
Arkansas Northeastern College
Arkansas Public School Resource Center
Arkansas School for Mathematics, Science and the Arts
Arkansas State University
Arkansas State University-Mountain Home
Big History Project
Black River Technical College
Brigham Young University Independent Study
Cossatot CC of UA
Crystal Bridges Museum of American Art
Delta YES, Inc.
Edgenuity, Inc.
Edmentum, Inc.
Florida Virtual School Global
Fuel Education (Formerly K12 Virtual School)
Graduation Alliance
Greenways Academy
Harrison School District
Hill Holdings, Inc dba Sylvan Learning Center
National Park Community College
North Arkansas College
Northwest Arkansas Community College
Northwest Arkansas Education Service Cooperative
Odysseyware Academy
Ozarka College
PCCUA-Phillips County College
Pearson Online & Blended Learning (Formerly Connections Education, LLC)
Proximity Learning
Rich Mountain Community College
SkillBott, Inc.
South Arkansas Community College
Southeast Arkansas Community Based Education Center
Southeast Arkansas College
Southern Arkansas University Magnolia
Southern Arkansas University Technical College
University of Arkansas at Little Rock
University of Arkansas Community College at Batesville
University of Arkansas Fort Smith
Virtual Arkansas
VLN Partners