Arkansas State Claims Commission JUN 2 4 2019

Please print in ink or type

State Claims Commission Arkansas

BEFORE THE STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION Of the State of Arkanese

dvMr. Do Not Write in These Spaces Mrs.	RECEIVED		Of the Case of Thingsay	Mr. RECEIVED
		1		
OMS. OMiss James Freeman, Claimant Claim No. Omega Filed (Month) (Day) (Year)	(Year)		, Claimant	□ Ms.
VS. Amount of Claim \$		Amount of Claim \$		vs.
State of Arkansas, Respondent		Fund		State of Arkansas, Respondent

(Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: THE UNDERSIGNED states on outh that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believes that they are true.	Tommie Freeman, the above named Claimant, of	(Street or		
(State) (2p Code) (Daytime Proce No.) (State) (2p Code) (Daytime Proce No.) (City) (State) (2p Code) (Daytime Proce No.) (City) (State) (2p Code) (Daytime Proce No.) (State) (2p Code) (Proce No.) (Par No.) (State) (2p Code) (Proce No.) (Par No.	10 / Labove married Challenin, Of	(Street or		
(Stace) (2p Code) (Daytume Phone No) of (Street and No) (City) (Stace) (2p Code) (Phone No.) (Pax No.) State agency Involved: Amount sought: \$\frac{1}{2}\text{ Odd} \text{ Office No.})\$ State agency Involved: Amount sought: \$\frac{1}{2}\text{ Odd} \text{ Odd} \text{ Office No.})\$ Month, day, year and place of incident or service: \$\frac{1}{2}\text{ Odd} \text{ Odd} \tex		10200	R.F.D. & No.)	(Crty)
(Stace) (2g Code) (Daytine Phone No) of (Street and No) (Chy) (Stace) (2p Code) (Phone No.) (Par No.) State agency Involved: Month, day, year and place of incident or writer: Month, day, year and place of incident or writer: Month, day, year and place of incident or writer: Explanation: A CALL A 30 PP		represented by		
State agency involved: Month, day, year and place of incident or service: JUNE DOUBLE HORSE TO SCATT HE STATE YOUNGE TO YOUNGE TO STATE YOUNGE TO YOUN	(State) (Zip Code) (Daytime Phone No.)		(Legal Counsel, if any, for	Claim)
State agency laworbed: Amount, day, year and place of incident or service: I Moe b, 2019 at Interstate 4000 Explanation: Around 930pm, Saughter was driving Act of a get to damp Robinson Maximum that Caughter was driving Act of a get to damp Robinson Maximum that Caughter was driving Act of the Roch 150 may be a get to damp Robinson Maximum that Caughter and active Roch 150 may be a get to damp the second and graph that the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof when the graph and that the following states was taken thereon: (Yes or No) (North) (Day) (North) (North) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (Amount) (Amount) (State) (State) (Amount) (Amount)	(Street and No.)	(2) . e		
Month day, year and place of incident or service: JUNE 10 2011 at Interstate 40 W Explanation: Around 9.30 pm, May daughter was driving my Car a 2011 NISSAN Maxima from Scott, AR to North 14the Right to AB to Lamp Right 2010 with her clausanter and neces. The 1938 driving in the Second lane go to trained at the Right 1938 driving in the Second lane go to trained at the Right 1938 driving in the Second lane go to trained at the Right 1938 driving in the Second lane go to trained at the Right 1939 driving the high that Caused 1930 driving the high that Caused 1930 driving the high that Caused 1930 driving the high that the Second lane go to the high way 1930 driving the high that the Second lane go to the high way 1930 driving the high that the Second lane go to the high way 1930 driving the high that the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof 1930 driving the high that the following action was taken thereon: 1930 driving the driving manner 1930 driving the high that the following action was taken thereon: 2010 driving manner 1930 driving the driving the driving that the or she verify believe that the page of the driving the driving that the page of the driving that the	. , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		d1 1 100 0	(Fax No.)
Explanation: A COLOR 9 30 pm, My Soughter was criving my Car a 2011 NSSAN Maxima trains (att AR to North 14th Right to		Amount sought:	# 1 089.	2
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof. As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof. (Year or No) (Normal) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (The UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the gare the state of the policy of the state of that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the gare true.	1 2 2 4	at Inter	state 40h)
Asparts of this complaint, the claimant makes the sptements, and answers the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof. Asparts of this complaint, the claimant makes the sptements, and answers the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof. (Year or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Oppartment) (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) The UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the gare true.	Explanation: Acound 7 30 pm My daught	er was de	IN THE WA	cara
Asparts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Name) (Name) (Name) (Name) (Name) (Name) (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (Eig) (State) (City) (Extreet) (Attach the high build the following matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the parents. (The UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the parents. (The parents of this complaint, and that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verity believe that the parents.		AK to Noc	th 19the	Kagh to
Asperts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof: (Yes or No) (Name)	you to comp Robinson With her o		ind nicce	,>be
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (North) (Day) (Year) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) (Author) (State)	when she came across a gathale	a na Talara	Ca Little	Kach
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) and that the following action was taken thereon: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: (In the above complaint, and that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set for the in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true.		hearing H	of tice a	that
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) and that the following action was taken thereon: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: (In the above complaint, and that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set for the in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true.	She had to proceed to the shoulder	and wait	- For some	ane to
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Department) and that the following action was taken thereon: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that thenature thereof is as follows: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) The UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true. (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Sta	come help change her tire. My da	ughter sta	atecits m	e she
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (and that the following action was taken thereon: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Tap Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: (and was acquired on the state on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set for th in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true. (The code of the state on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set for th in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true.	also poticed several more cars or	; the side	eat the h	ighuay
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (and that the following action was taken thereon: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) The UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verify believe that they are true.	que to the same patrale. Atter rep	lacing he	rtice wit	-hy a space
As parts of this complaint, the claimant makes the statements, and answers the following questions, as indicated: (1) Has claim been presented to any state department or officer thereof			. –	the
; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Department) and that the following action was taken thereon: and that \$\frac{1}{2}\$ was paid thereon: (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (State) (State) (State) (State) (State) THE UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believe that they are true.	··· stacked to the format car	USECUTIVE	rice to go +	-10+7
; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Department) and that the following action was taken thereon: and that \$				
; when? (Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Department) and that the following action was taken thereon: and that \$				
(Yes or No) (Month) (Day) (Year) (Department) and that the following action was taken thereon: and that \$\frac{1}{2}\$ was paid thereon: (2) Has any third person or corporation an interest in this claim? (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that then ature thereof is as follows: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that then ature thereof is as follows: (Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) THE UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believed that they are true.	•			partment or officer thereof
and that \$ was paid thereon: (2) Has any third person or corporation an interest in this claim?; if so, state name and address (Name)	(Yesor No) (Month) (Day) (Year)		(Department)	
(Name) (Street or R.F.D. & No.) (City) (State) (Zip Code) and that the nature thereof is as follows:	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
THE UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believe that they are true.	and that \$ was paid thereon: (2) Has any third person or corporation	n an interest in this claim?	; if s	io, state name and address
THE UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believes that they are true.		(City)	(State)	(Zip Code)
THE UNDERSIGNED states on onth that he or she is familiar with the matters and things set forth in the above complaint, and that he or she verily believe that they are true.				
that they are true. Tree man	:andwasackmacau		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	, in the following manner
that they are true. Tree man	THE UNDERSIGNED states on outh that he or she is femiliar with the matters on	d things set forth in the a	have complaint and that	he or the verily helieve
Tanancia treemen		-	\ \	no or the courty beauty
	etamonia treeman	nnie 5		,
(Print Claimant/Representative Name) (Signature of Claimant/Representative)	(Print Claimant/Representative Name)	(Signature	of Claimant/Represer	ıtative)
SWORN TO and subscribed before me at Little Rock Arkangar	SWORN TO and subscribed before me a	1 Little Rock	۷	Arkansar
Comm. EXP: 2 (City) (State)	COMM. EXP. 2			
(SEAL) 10-23-2027 on this 2/ day of June , 20/9	(SEAL) 10-23-2027 on this 2/ da	y of June		
(Date) (Month) (Year)	★:No. 12363284: ★ = (Date)		(Month)	(Year)
	PULASKI COUNTY COUNTY	=	• •	` ,
O. COUNTY .	PURILIC ARRESTA		(Notary Public)	
COUNTY Public)	SF1- R7/99 My Commission Expires: Uctob	er	2.5	Z=27-
(Signature of Claimant/Representative) Commonwealth Sworn to and subscribed before me at				

Arkansas ammission
Arkansas Arkansas Arkansas Arkansas STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION MOTOR VEHICLE ACCIDENT REPORT FORM SECTIONAL
kans omn.
CLAIMANT TOWER ME Freeman Chims Co. MADDRESS
CITY & STATEZIP CODE
DATE OF ACCIDENT: 6-6-19 ZIP CODE. TIME: 9:30 pm
MOTOR VEHICLE DAMAGED: TYPE MAKE Nissan YEAR 2011
DRIVEN BY: Chelonda Freeman ADDRESS
Give a brief description of accident, showing how accident happened, exact loss and externo of damage to car.
Daughter was driving car on I-110W and came upon a potho
in the highway that caused dent to manufacture original in

Has this vehicle been repaired? Yes () No (×) If repairs have been made, githe following information: Amount \$ 1.089.75 . Have you paid for trepairs? Yes () No () NOTE: Attach a copy of repair bill.
If repairs have not been made, list three estimates below and $\underline{\text{attach copies}}$ of ear of them.
NAME ADDRESS AMOUNT
1. McLarty Nissan Colonel Glenn \$\$1,089.75
2
3
SECTION III Was vehicle covered by Insurance? Yes (X) No () Liability Only (X)
Comprehensive: Yes () No () What is your deductible? \$
Collision: Yes () No () What is your deductible? \$
NAME OF INSURANCE CARRIER ADDRESS
Geico ******
SECTION IV Type of State Vehicle involvedLicense No
DriverProperty of which State Agency
If accident was investigated by the State Police, give name of investigati
officer: If investigation was made by some other agency,
give name and title of officer making the investigation:

SECTION V The undersigned states on oath that he/she is familiar with the matters and thin set forth in the above statement, and that he/she verily believes that the
Signature of Claimant
Signature of Claimant Sworn to and subscribed before me at Little Rock Arkansar City, State on this 21 day of June, 2019 Wear
No. 12363284: * Sworn to and subscribed before the at Attric Rock Arkansar City, State
(Notary Seal): 6 City, State county on this 21 day of June , 2019 day month year
My Commission Expires October 23, 2027 Notary Public

BEFORE THE ARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION

TOMMIE FREEMAN CLAIMANT

V. CLAIM NO. 191261

ARKANSAS DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

RESPONDENT

ORDER

Now before the Arkansas State Claims Commission (the "Claims Commission") is the motion filed by the Arkansas Department of Transportation (the "Respondent") to dismiss the claim of Tommie Freeman (the "Claimant"). Based upon a review of Respondent's motion, the arguments made therein, and the law of Arkansas, the Claims Commission hereby finds as follows:

- 1. The Claims Commission has jurisdiction to hear this claim pursuant to Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-204(a).
- 2. Claimant filed the instant claim, alleging that Claimant's vehicle was damaged after hitting a pothole on a state highway on June 6, 2019.
- 3. Respondent filed a motion to dismiss, arguing that Claimant failed to show that Respondent had prior knowledge of a pothole yet failed to respond within a reasonable amount of time to repair it. Respondent seeks dismissal pursuant to Rule 12(b)(6) of the Arkansas Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 4. Claimant responded to the motion, arguing that, in light of the size and depth of the pothole, it "could have only gotten that way over a long length of time." Claimant also stated that Respondent knew about the pothole because it "went on KARK news (channel 4) to address the situation on June 25, 2019 . . . [regarding] complaint of damage that caused flat tires and damage to vehicles on June 24, 2019."

- 5. Respondent filed a reply brief, arguing that Claimant's response only offers evidence that Respondent knew of the pothole on June 24, 2019, which was "weeks after Claimant's incident."
- 6. In reviewing this motion to dismiss, the Claims Commission must treat the facts alleged in the complaint as true and view them in a light most favorable to the Claimant. *See Hodges v. Lamora*, 337 Ark. 470, 989 S.W.2d 530 (1999). All reasonable inferences must be resolved in favor of the Claimant, and the complaint must be liberally construed. *See id.* However, the Claimant must allege facts, not mere conclusions. *Dockery v. Morgan*, 2011 Ark. 94 at *6, 380 S.W.3d 377, 382. The facts alleged in the complaint will be treated as true, but not "a plaintiff's theories, speculation, or statutory interpretation." *See id.* (citing *Hodges*, 337 Ark. 470, 989 S.W.2d 530 (1999)).
- 7. The Claims Commission agrees with Respondent that dismissal of this claim is proper. Claimant did not allege any facts regarding Respondent's prior knowledge of a pothole or failure to repair it within a reasonable amount of time. The fact that Respondent knew of the pothole on June 24, 2019, does not demonstrate that Respondent knew of the pothole prior to June 6, 2019. Respondent is unable to monitor every part of the nearly 16,000 miles of state highways at all times. Respondent is also unable to monitor every section of the nearly 16,000 miles of state highways that have had a pothole at one time. As stated by Respondent in the motion to dismiss, encountering a pothole is a risk assumed by the public in general as a part of travel. In the absence of evidence that Respondent had prior knowledge of the pothole that caused Claimant's damage and failed to repair it in a reasonable amount of time, the existence of a pothole is insufficient to establish liability.
- 8. As such, Respondent's Motion to dismiss is GRANTED, and Claimant's claim is DISMISSED WITHOUT PREJUDICE.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Lewy C. Kinslow

ARKANSAS STATE CLAIMS COMMISSION

Courtney Baird Dexter Booth Henry Kinslow, Co-Chair Paul Morris, Co-Chair Sylvester Smith

DATE: <u>August 21, 2019</u>

Notice(s) which may apply to your claim

- (1) A party has forty (40) days from the date of this Order to file a Motion for Reconsideration or a Notice of Appeal with the Claims Commission. Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-211(a)(1). If a Motion for Reconsideration is denied, that party then has twenty (20) days from the date of the denial of the Motion for Reconsideration to file a Notice of Appeal with the Claims Commission. Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-211(a)(1)(B)(ii). A decision of the Claims Commission may only be appealed to the General Assembly. Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-211(a)(3).
- (2) If a Claimant is awarded less than \$15,000.00 by the Claims Commission at hearing, that claim is held forty (40) days from the date of disposition before payment will be processed. *See* Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-211(a). Note: This does not apply to agency admissions of liability and negotiated settlement agreements.
- (3) Awards or negotiated settlement agreements of \$15,000.00 or more are referred to the General Assembly for approval and authorization to pay. Ark. Code Ann. § 19-10-215(b).

Claim # 191261

Notice of Appeal with the Claims Commission

State Claims Commission

Arkansas

I, Tommie Freeman, on the behalf of my daughter Chelonda Freeman on the night of June 6, 2019 was driving my vehicle on I-40 that caused sever damage to tire and rim from a pothole. I would like to appeal the decision made by the Commission due to the fact that it was negligence on ARDOT. My daughter's incident happened June 6th where she noticed that she was not the only individual on the side of the road due to damage caused by a pothole. So, my argument is that I could not have only been the only person to make a complaint about the potholes in the area. From the evidence I presented with the KARK news story, they stated 10 more cars made complaints about flat tires due to the bad road conditions in that same area but were unable to fix it on June 24th because of weather conditions. With that statement being made, you would know that ARDOT was made aware prior of the road conditions in order to plan road repair for that date but Respondent stated "unable to monitor every part of the nearly 16,000 miles of state highways". So again, my argument is that if the highway is so vast and large that its hard to keep monitor of the road conditions at all times. How is that ARDOT was able to make a news story and mention they were going to schedule a repair for that week of June 24th without having prior knowledge of potholes. I believe this and prior information such as pictures and video of the highway and damage to rim and tire that I have submitted is enough for me to present my case before the Claims Commission.

Date: September 17, 2019

Johnne Ju