JOINT PERFORMANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE

SEPTEMBER 9, 2015

MINUTES

The Joint Performance Review Committee met Wednesday, September 9, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in Room A, Mac Building, Little Rock, Arkansas.

Committee members present were Senator Alan Clark, Co-Chair, Linda Collins-Smith, John Cooper, Jane English, Jeremy Hutchinson, Terry Rice, and Gary Stubblefield, and Representatives Kim Hammer, Co-Chair, Scott Baltz, Jana Della Rosa, Kenneth Ferguson, Charlene Fite, Mary "Prissy" Hickerson, Milton Nicks, John Walker, and Dave Wallace.

Other legislators present were Linda Chesterfield Bart Hester, Bill Sample, Greg Standridge, and Eddie Joe Williams, and Representatives Charles Armstrong, Bob Ballinger, Mary Broadaway, Jim Dotson, Trevor Drown, Jon Eubanks, David Fielding, Justin Gonzales, David Hillman, Greg Leding, Kelley Linck, Frederick Love, Mark McElroy, Stephen Meeks, Betty Overbey, Sue Scott, and James Sorvillo.

Call to Order

Representative Hammer called the meeting to order.

Approval of Minutes - July 30, 2015 [EXHIBIT C]

A motion to approve the minutes of the July 30, 2015 JPR Committee meeting was made by Senator Cooper and seconded by Senator Collins-Smith. The motion carried.

Consideration of Motion: "To Authorize Committee Co-Chairs to Approve Special Expenses Incurred by the Committee [Exhibit D]

A motion to authorize Committee Co-Chairs to approve special expenses incurred by the Committee was made by Representative Hickerson and seconded by Senator Hutchinson. The motion carried.

Continue Discussion of Licensing Procedures Used by the office of Motor Vehicle and the Office of Revenue Office Administration, Arkansas Department of Finance and Administration (DF&A) [Exhibit E]

Representative Hammer recognized Walter Anger, Assistant Commissioner for Operations, Office of Financial and Management Services, DF&A, Marla McHughes, Administrator, Office of Revenue, Office Administration, DF&A, and Roger Duren, Administrator, Office of Motor Vehicle, DF&A.

Ms. McHughes responded to questions by legislators regarding the Office of Revenue's employee turnover, job standards, training, and evaluations. She gave the following information:

- Total number of employees in all revenue offices throughout the state 472
- Current employee turnover rate 15%
- Cost for training service representatives \$2,000 per employee
- Employee training consists of computer based training, navigation of the computer system, review of procedural manuals, including motor vehicle and drivers license manuals
- Applicants must meet basic job standards and requirements

Ms. McHughes responded to a question concerning success rates by Office of Revenue for hiring managers. She said she will collect the requested data for the committee.

Tim Leathers was asked to research the number of positions within the Office of Revenue affected by the hiring of two persons in the same position within a one-year timeframe. He said the information will be obtained and provided to the committee.

Kay Barnhill, Personnel Administrator, Office of Personnel Management, DF&A answered questions posed by legislators concerning workforce retention, including exit interview data. She was asked to compile a list of state agencies who perform exit interviews. Ms. Barnhill was also asked to compile a report regarding citizen complaints about revenue offices.

Representative Hammer introduced Misty Banks, Accounting and Title Clerk, and Bridgette Chandler, Everett Buick, GMC, Bryant, Arkansas. Representative Hammer told committee members that Ms. Banks and Ms. Chandler were invited by the Co-Chairs to give the automobile dealer's perspective regarding registering new vehicles for their customers. He also said that the Everett GMC Buick dealership in Bryant was named the number one overall auto dealership in the world for the month of August, 2015.

According to the control of the cont

Ms. Banks told legislators their dealership sold over 600 vehicles in August, 2015. She said that in prior years, automobile dealers had been able to register vehicle purchases online with the Office of Revenue. Currently, automobile dealers now have to provide their customers with the paperwork necessary to register their vehicle. She believes the installation of a kiosk inside dealerships for vehicle registration and the renewal of car tags would help customers. Ms. Chandler discussed the 30 day temporary vehicle tags required by the Office of Revenue. She said that 30 days for both dealers and customers to complete the title process of vehicle purchase is unrealistic and should be extended to 40 or 60 days.

Continued Discussion of the Review of State Employee Evaluations/Vetting Process, and Overview of the 360° Employee/Leadership Evaluation Process [Exhibit G, G-1]

Representative Hammer recognized Kay Barnhill to discuss an employee evaluation system called the 360° evaluation used by several companies. Ms. Barnhill gave an overview of the 360° evaluation system, commonly known as a multi-source evaluation system. She outlined the system:

Employees select their manager, peers, and subordinates to evaluate their performance

- the system is typically used for managerial positions
- Feedback from evaluations is anonymous and gathered from different sources
- The evaluation system requires a coach and training to compile the evaluations

Ms. Barnhill said advantages of this system is that it provides different perspectives of job performances. Disadvantages are the cost and complexity. She also said that state agency evaluations are used for the purpose of compensation and salary adjustment decisions, whereas the 360° evaluation system was developed for the overall performance evaluation of an agency or workforce.

Overview of the Information Network of Arkansas (INA), A State Governing Board, What They Do and Their Mission (Established by Statute §25-27-101 et. Seq.) [Exhibit G, G-1] Representative Hammer recognized Bob Sanders, General Manager, and Janet Harris, Director of Operations, Information Network of Arkansas (INA). Mill Sanders gave an overview of INA which includes:

- > INA was created through legislation in 1995 to accelerate e-government in Arkansas
- INA is a public/private partnership with NIC, eGovernment Services for Federal, State, and Local Government
- The INA mission was established by legislation to explore and expand access to public information and services for citizens and businesses
- NIC is the largest provider of e-government services in the U.S. serving 30 states and 3,600 different state, local and federal government entities
- > INA operates as a self-funded business model with no state appropriation
- > Primary funding are fees paid by businesses using the service
- INA is governed by a twelve-member board of public and private members
- ➤ INA has developed and supports 750 websites and services for state and local government, including elected official searches, online property tax payment, online business franchise tax, and online criminal background checks
- INA has an enterprise payment processing system connected to the state financial system for auditing purposes
- Web and mobile application development is provided to state agencies at a subsidized rate
- ➤ INA serves 280 government entities within the state; state agencies, boards and commissions, cities, counties, county tax collectors, and prosecuting attorneys
- INA has a dedicated security team with three different annual third party audits of finances, controls and security

Janet Harris described the services that INA provides:

- INA partners with the Arkansas Game and Fish Commission for their mobile application, which hunters use for logging in observation history on hunts, checking game, and/or permit applications
- INA partners with the Department of Higher Education to provide a universal mobile application, allowing students to apply for available scholarships
- INA launched an e-filing site with the Office of State Auditor two years ago allowing citizens access to services

- INA partners with fifty-three county collectors statewide providing online property tax payments
- o INA partners with the Office of Motor Vehicle, DF&A to provide an online tag renewal system through a mobile application, which allows citizen to renew their car tags from their mobile device
- o INA partnered with the Arkansas Highway and Transportation Department two years ago to provide the IDrive Arkansas mobile application
- o The state portal, Arkansas.gov for all state government services has had 6 million visitors since 2011

Legislators discussed the contract between INA and the state fees, transaction fees, and funding.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:15 p.m.

