

1 State of Arkansas
2 89th General Assembly
3 Regular Session, 2013
4

A Bill

HOUSE BILL 1484

5 By: Representative J. Edwards
6

For An Act To Be Entitled

8 AN ACT CONCERNING THE MENTAL EVALUATION OF A CRIMINAL
9 DEFENDANT; AND FOR OTHER PURPOSES.
10

Subtitle

11 CONCERNING THE MENTAL EVALUATION OF A
12 CRIMINAL DEFENDANT.
13

14
15
16
17 BE IT ENACTED BY THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY OF THE STATE OF ARKANSAS:
18

19 SECTION 1. Arkansas Code § 5-2-305 is amended to read as follows:
20 5-2-305. Mental health examination of defendant.

21 (a)(1) Subject to the provisions of §§ 5-2-304 and 5-2-311, the court
22 shall immediately suspend any further proceedings in a prosecution if+

23 (A)(i) A defendant charged in circuit court files notice
24 that he or she intends to rely upon the defense of mental disease or defect+.

25 ~~(B) There is reason to believe that the mental disease or~~
26 ~~defect of the defendant will or has become an issue in the cause+;~~

27 ~~(C) A defendant charged in circuit court files notice that~~
28 ~~he or she will put in issue his or her fitness to proceed; or~~

29 ~~(D) There is reason to doubt the defendant's fitness to~~
30 ~~proceed+.~~

31 (ii) After the notice of intent to raise the defense
32 of not guilty for reason of mental disease or defect is filed, any party may
33 petition the court for a criminal responsibility examination and opinion.

34 (iii)(a) It is not necessary for the petitioner to
35 request a fitness-to-proceed examination if fitness to proceed does not
36 appear to be an issue.



1 (b) An examiner shall not render an opinion or
2 issue a report on criminal responsibility if the examiner believes that the
3 defendant is not fit to proceed.

4 (c) In a case under subdivision (a)(1)(A)(ii)
5 of this section, the criminal responsibility examination shall be suspended
6 and the court notified immediately that there is a question as to the
7 defendant's fitness to proceed.

8 (B)(i) Any party or the court raises the issue of the
9 defendant's fitness to proceed.

10 (ii) The court shall order a fitness-to-proceed
11 examination if it finds there is a reasonable suspicion that a defendant is
12 not fit to proceed.

13 (2)(A) The fitness-to-proceed examination and the criminal
14 responsibility examination and request for an opinion on the defendant's
15 criminal responsibility are two distinctly different examinations.

16 (B) The fitness-to-proceed examination and the criminal
17 responsibility examination may be done at the same time only if the defendant
18 simultaneously raises the issue of the defendant's fitness to proceed and
19 files notice that he or she intends to rely upon the defense of mental
20 disease or defect.

21 (C) In all other cases the process is bifurcated.

22 (3)(A) A defendant shall not be found not guilty by reason of
23 mental disease or defect in the absence of proof of a mental disease or
24 defect.

25 (B) A court shall not order the Division of Behavioral
26 Health of the Department of Human Services to conduct a criminal
27 responsibility examination if a fitness-to-proceed examination has previously
28 determined that the defendant does not have a mental disease or defect unless
29 the requesting party can show reasonable cause to believe:

30 (i) There is evidence of a mental disease or defect
31 that was not fully considered in the previous criminal responsibility
32 examination; or

33 (ii) That the prior opinion that the defendant does
34 not have a mental disease or defect was based on information or facts later
35 shown to be false or unreliable.

36 ~~(2)(A)~~(4)(A) If a trial jury has been impaneled and the court

1 suspends proceedings under subdivision (a)(1) of this section, the court may
2 retain the jury or declare a mistrial and discharge the jury.

3 (B) A discharge of the trial jury is not a bar to further
4 prosecution.

5 (b)(1) Upon suspension of further proceedings in the prosecution, the
6 court shall enter an order:

7 (A) Directing that the defendant undergo examination and
8 observation by one (1) or more qualified psychiatrists or qualified
9 psychologists;

10 (B) Appointing one (1) or more qualified psychiatrists not
11 practicing within the Arkansas State Hospital to make an examination and
12 report on the mental condition of the defendant; or

13 (C) Directing the Director of the Division of Behavioral
14 Health of the Department of Human Services to determine who will examine and
15 report upon the mental condition of the defendant.

16 (2) The Director of the Division of Behavioral Health of the
17 Department of Human Services or his or her designee shall determine the
18 location of the ~~forensic~~ examination.

19 (3) The ~~forensic~~ examination shall be for a period not exceeding
20 ~~thirty (30)~~ sixty (60) days or such longer period as the Director of the
21 Division of Behavioral Health of the Department of Human Services or his or
22 her designee determines to be necessary for the purpose of the ~~forensic~~
23 examination.

24 (4)(A)(i) ~~A uniform evaluation order shall be developed by the~~
25 ~~Administrative Office of the Courts, the office of the Prosecutor~~
26 ~~Coordinator, and the Department of Human Services. Two (2) distinctly~~
27 different uniform evaluation orders shall be developed by the Administrative
28 Office of the Courts, the office of the Prosecutor Coordinator, the
29 Department of Human Services, and the Arkansas Public Defender Commission.
30 One (1) uniform evaluation order shall be for a fitness-to-proceed
31 examination and opinion and the other uniform evaluation order shall be for
32 a criminal responsibility examination and opinion.

33 (ii) At a minimum the uniform ~~evaluation order~~
34 examination orders shall contain the:

35 (a) Defendant's name, age, gender, and race;

36 (b) Charges pending against the defendant;

1 (c) Defendant's attorney's name and address;
 2 (d) Defendant's custody status;
 3 (e) Case number; ~~and~~
 4 (f) ~~Case number and a~~ A unique identifying
 5 number on the incident reporting form as required by the Arkansas Crime
 6 Information Center; and

7 (g) The name of the requesting attorney.

8 (iii) The uniform evaluation order shall be utilized
 9 any time that a defendant is ordered to be examined by the court pursuant to
 10 this section, and a copy of the uniform evaluation order shall be forwarded
 11 to the Director of the Department of Human Services or his or her designee.

12 (iv) No ~~forensic~~ examination under this subchapter
 13 shall be conducted without using ~~the~~ a uniform evaluation order.

14 (v) Fitness-to-proceed and criminal responsibility
 15 examination orders may be ordered at the same time in accordance with
 16 subdivision (a)(1) of this section but they may not be combined into one (1)
 17 uniform evaluation order and shall be tracked separately by the Division of
 18 Behavioral Health of the Department of Human Services.

19 (B)(i) The Division of Behavioral Health of the Department
 20 of Human Services shall maintain a database of all examinations of defendants
 21 performed pursuant to this ~~chapter~~ subchapter.

22 (ii) The database shall be maintained in a manner to
 23 enable it to generate reports and data compilations either with or without
 24 personal identifying information.

25 (iii) A person examined or treated pursuant to this
 26 subchapter shall be assigned an anonymous identifier that permits researchers
 27 to determine how many times the criminal justice system is examining and
 28 treating the same persons without making public the identity or personal
 29 information of a person.

30 ~~(ii)-(a)-(iv)~~ (iv) At a minimum the database shall contain
 31 ~~the information on the uniform evaluation order as provided in subdivision~~
 32 ~~(b)(4)(A)(ii) of this section;~~

33 (a) The information on the uniform evaluation
 34 order as provided in subdivision (b)(4)(A)(ii) of this section;

35 (b) The name of the judge that ordered the
 36 examination;

1 (c) The name of the attorney that requested
 2 the examination;

3 (d) The name of the examiner that conducted
 4 the examination;

5 (e) The result of the examination;

6 (f) Whether there was a hearing or trial to
 7 contest the examination's findings;

8 (g) If the defendant is found not fit to
 9 proceed, whether the defendant was restored to fitness to proceed; and

10 (h) If the defendant is found not guilty by
 11 reason of mental disease or defect, the defendant's progress through his or
 12 her commitment and conditional release.

13 (v) The database should be designed in a manner that
 14 allows the General Assembly, researchers, and the public to track the
 15 efficiency and effectiveness of the examination process and the restoration
 16 and treatment programs of the Division of Behavioral Health of the Department
 17 of Human Services without invading the privacy of individual defendants and
 18 patients.

19 ~~(b) Additionally, the database shall track~~
 20 ~~insanity acquittees and their conditional release.~~

21 (c)(1) Upon completion of a forensic an examination pursuant to
 22 subsection (b) of this section, the court may enter an order providing for
 23 further examination and may order the defendant committed to the Arkansas
 24 State Hospital or other appropriate facility for further examination and
 25 observation if the court determines that commitment and further examination
 26 and observation are warranted.

27 (2) When the defendant has previously been found fit to proceed,
 28 the court may order a second or subsequent examination to determine a
 29 defendant's fitness to proceed only if the court:

30 (A) Finds reasonable cause to believe that new or
 31 previously undiscovered evidence calls into question the factual, legal or
 32 scientific basis of the opinion upon which the previous finding of fitness
 33 relied;

34 (B) Finds reasonable cause to believe that the defendant's
 35 mental condition has changed; or

36 (C) Sets forth a factual or legal basis upon which to

1 order another examination.

2 ~~(d)(1) A report of a forensic examination shall include the following:~~

3 ~~(A) A description of the nature of the forensic~~
4 ~~examination;~~

5 ~~(B) A substantiated diagnosis in the terminology of the~~
6 ~~American Psychiatric Association's current edition of the Diagnostic and~~
7 ~~Statistical Manual;~~

8 ~~(C) An opinion on whether the defendant lacks the capacity~~
9 ~~to understand the proceedings against him or her and to assist effectively in~~
10 ~~his or her own defense as a consequence of mental disease or defect;~~

11 ~~(D) A description of any evidence that the defendant is~~
12 ~~feigning a sign or symptom of mental disease or defect;~~

13 ~~(E)(i) An opinion as to whether the defendant has the~~
14 ~~capacity to understand the proceedings against him or her and to assist~~
15 ~~effectively in his or her own defense.~~

16 ~~(ii) If the opinion under subdivision (d)(1)(E)(i)~~
17 ~~of this section is that the defendant has the capacity to understand the~~
18 ~~proceedings and to effectively assist in his or her own defense, then the~~
19 ~~examiner shall further examine the defendant and include in the report of the~~
20 ~~forensic examination an opinion as to the extent, if any, to which the~~
21 ~~capacity of the defendant to appreciate the criminality of his or her conduct~~
22 ~~or to conform his or her conduct to the requirements of law was impaired at~~
23 ~~the time of the conduct alleged.~~

24 ~~(iii) An opinion under subdivision (d)(1)(E)(i) or~~
25 ~~(d)(1)(E)(ii) of this section shall also include a description of the~~
26 ~~reasoning used by the examiner to support the opinion; and~~

27 ~~(F)(i) When directed by the court, an opinion as to the~~
28 ~~capacity of the defendant to have the culpable mental state that is required~~
29 ~~to establish an element of the offense charged.~~

30 ~~(ii) An opinion under subdivision (d)(1)(F)(i) of~~
31 ~~this section shall also include a description of the reasoning used by the~~
32 ~~examiner to support the opinion.~~

33 ~~(2) In addition to the information required in subdivision~~
34 ~~(d)(1) of this section, the report of the forensic examination shall include~~
35 ~~a separate explanation of:~~

36 ~~(A) The sign or symptom of mental disease or defect that~~

1 ~~led to the opinion on the presence of mental disease or defect; and~~

2 ~~(B) The evidence that supports the opinion of the examiner~~
3 ~~on the capacity of the defendant to understand the proceedings against him or~~
4 ~~her and the defendant's capacity to assist in his or her own defense.~~

5 (d)(1) An examiner's report under this subchapter shall include:

6 (A) A description of the nature of the examination;

7 (B) A description of any evidence that the defendant is
8 feigning a sign or symptom of mental disease or defect;

9 (C) A specific description of the signs or symptoms of
10 mental disease or defect if in the opinion of the examiner the defendant has
11 a mental disease or defect; and

12 (D) A substantiated diagnosis in the terminology of the
13 American Psychiatric Association's current edition of the Diagnostic and
14 Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders.

15 (2) In addition to the information in subdivision (d)(1) of this
16 section, a report of a fitness-to-proceed examination shall specifically
17 include an opinion on whether the defendant lacks the capacity to understand
18 the proceedings against him or her and to assist effectively in his or her
19 own defense as a consequence of mental disease or defect and an explanation
20 of the examiner's opinion and the basis of the opinion.

21 (3) In addition to the information in subdivision (d)(1) of this
22 section, a report of a criminal responsibility examination shall include the
23 following:

24 (A) An opinion as to whether as the result of a mental
25 disease or defect the defendant at the time of the alleged criminal conduct
26 lacked the capacity to appreciate the criminality of his or her conduct or to
27 conform his or her conduct to the requirements of law and an explanation of
28 the examiner's opinion and the basis of the opinion; and

29 (B) An opinion as to the capacity of the defendant to have
30 the culpable mental state that is required to establish an element of the
31 offense charged with an explanation of the examiner's opinion and the basis
32 of the opinion.

33 (e) If a forensic an examination cannot be conducted because of the
34 unwillingness of the defendant to participate in the forensic examination,
35 the report of the forensic examination shall so state and shall include, if
36 possible, an opinion as to whether the unwillingness of the defendant is the

1 result of mental disease or defect.

2 (f)(1) A person designated to perform a ~~forensic~~ an examination shall
3 file the report of the ~~forensic~~ examination with the clerk of the court, and
4 the clerk of the court shall mail a copy to the defense attorney and a copy
5 to the prosecuting attorney.

6 (2) Upon entry of an order by a circuit court, a copy of the
7 report of the ~~forensic~~ examination concerning a defendant shall be provided
8 to the circuit court by the person designated to perform the ~~forensic~~
9 examination.

10 (g)(1) Notwithstanding the provision of any statute enacted prior to
11 January 1, 1976, any existing medical or pertinent record in the custody of a
12 public agency shall be made available to the examiner and ~~counsel to the~~
13 prosecuting attorney and the defendant's attorney for inspection and copying.

14 (2) The court shall require the prosecuting attorney to provide
15 to the examiner any information relevant to the ~~forensic~~ examination,
16 including, but not limited to:

17 (A) The name and address of any attorney involved in the
18 matter;

19 (B) Information about the alleged offense; and

20 (C) Any information about the defendant's background that
21 is deemed relevant to the ~~forensic~~ examination, including the criminal
22 history of the defendant.

23 (3) The court may require the attorney for the defendant to
24 provide any available information relevant to the ~~forensic~~ examination,
25 including, but not limited to, a:

26 (A) Psychiatric record;

27 (B) Medical record; or

28 (C) Record pertaining to treatment of the defendant for
29 substance or alcohol abuse.

30 (h)(1) When a ~~forensic~~ an examination of a defendant has been
31 completed, the county from which the defendant had been sent for the ~~forensic~~
32 examination shall procure the defendant within three (3) working days from
33 the Arkansas State Hospital or from a designated receiving facility or
34 program or other facility where the ~~forensic~~ examination was performed.

35 (2) If the county fails to procure the defendant within this
36 three-day period, the county shall bear any room or board costs on the fourth

1 and subsequent days.

2 (i) A person under commitment and supervision of the Department of
3 Correction who is a defendant charged in circuit court shall not undergo an
4 examination or observation conducted by a psychiatrist or other mental health
5 employee of the Department of Correction to determine the mental condition of
6 the defendant.

7 (j)(1) A person or entity that provides treatment under this
8 subchapter may impose a charge for the cost of the treatment.

9 (2) A charge for costs under subdivision (j)(1) of this section
10 may not exceed the actual cost of the treatment.

11 (3)(A) The Division of Behavioral Health of the Department of
12 Human Services shall promulgate rules establishing reasonable charges for
13 costs of treatment under this subchapter.

14 (B) Rules establishing reasonable charges for costs of
15 treatment under this subchapter shall:

16 (i) Provide for postponing the collection of the
17 charges based on clinical considerations or the patient's inability to pay,
18 or both; and

19 (ii) Waive charges for treatment of defendants who
20 plead guilty or nolo contendere or are found guilty at trial.

21 (k) An examination report required to be filed with the clerk of the
22 court under this subchapter is a public record.

23 (l) This subchapter does not preclude the defendant from having a
24 fitness-to-proceed examination or a criminal responsibility examination
25 conducted by a defense expert or from maintaining the defense of not guilty
26 by reason of mental disease or defect using testimony from a defense expert
27 or other evidence.

28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36